

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE  
AT NASHVILLE**

---

JOSHUA GARTON,

*Plaintiff,*

v.

W. RAY CROUCH, DAVID RAUSCH,  
BRADLEY NEALON, RUSSELL  
WINKLER, JOSHUA MELTON,  
JOSEPH CRAIG, DONALD ARNOLD,  
ANDREW VALLEE, and  
CITY OF DICKSON, TENNESSEE,

*Defendants.*

§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§

Case No. 3:21-cv-00338

---

**PLAINTIFF’S STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL WITH PREJUDICE AS TO  
DEFENDANTS JOSEPH CRAIG, W. RAY CROUCH, AND ANDREW VALLEE**

---

Comes now the Plaintiff, through counsel, and respectfully notifies the Court that—  
having settled his claims with Defendants Joseph Craig, W. Ray Crouch, and Andrew  
Vallee—the Plaintiff stipulates that his claims against Defendants Joseph Craig, W. Ray  
Crouch, and Andrew Vallee should be dismissed with prejudice. *See* Fed. R. Civ. P. 21  
(“On motion or on its own, the court may at any time, on just terms, add or drop a party.”).

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Daniel A. Horwitz  
DANIEL A. HORWITZ, BPR #032176  
LINDSAY SMITH, BPR #035937  
MELISSA K. DIX, BPR #038535  
HORWITZ LAW, PLLC  
4016 WESTLAWN DR.  
NASHVILLE, TN 37209  
[daniel@horwitz.law](mailto:daniel@horwitz.law)  
[lindsay@horwitz.law](mailto:lindsay@horwitz.law)  
[melissa@horwitz.law](mailto:melissa@horwitz.law)  
(615) 739-2888

Brice M. Timmons #29582  
Craig A. Edgington #38205  
DONATI LAW, PLLC  
1545 Union Ave.  
Memphis, Tennessee 38104  
(901) 278-1004 – Telephone  
(901) 278-3111 – Facsimile  
[brice@donatilaw.com](mailto:brice@donatilaw.com)  
[craig@donatilaw.com](mailto:craig@donatilaw.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 30<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2023, a copy of the foregoing was transmitted via CM/ECF to:

Amanda S. Jordan  
Meghan Murphy  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
P.O. Box 20207  
Nashville, TN 37202-0207  
[amanda.jordan@ag.tn.gov](mailto:amanda.jordan@ag.tn.gov)  
[meghan.murphy@ag.tn.gov](mailto:meghan.murphy@ag.tn.gov)

Mary Elizabeth McCullohs  
Lauren Kisner  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 20207  
Nashville, TN 37202-0207  
[mary.mccullohs@ag.tn.gov](mailto:mary.mccullohs@ag.tn.gov)  
[lauren.kisner@ag.tn.gov](mailto:lauren.kisner@ag.tn.gov)

By: /s/ Daniel A. Horwitz